Result of MBBS 2nd Prof. Annual 2011 Examinations was announced on the 20th of February 2012 and the Pass percentage of the result was 53.29% inclusive of all Public and Private Medical Colleges (09 Public and 11 Private) affiliated with University of Health Sciences, Lahore. The result of individual medical colleges ranged from 74.21% in Allama Iqbal Medical College, Lahore to 25.33% in Continental Medical College, Lahore. This isn't much different from results of previous years. Subject-wise results are provided below:

Pharmacology and Therapeutics:

Pharmacology and therapeutics deals with the prescriptions, dosage, indications and contra-indications of usage and cytotoxicity of drugs. It is a subject that lays the foundation of clinical practice and treatment and one that is never taught again in the next two years of medical education. The result in this subject is 64.28%.

General Pathology:

General Pathology deals with the effect of diseases on cells and different organs and systems of the body. Knowledge of the subject lays the foundation for understanding the diseases in all clinical sciences taught in the next two years. The result in this subject is 79.84%

Forensic Medicine and Toxicology:

Forensic Medicine and Toxicology deals with medico-legal aspects and medical jurisprudence. The result in this subject is 88.56%.
Behavioural Sciences:

Behavioural Sciences deals with medical ethics, communication and interpersonal skills including moral and social responsibilities of doctors. This is the subject that only has Multiple Choice Questions (MCQs) for assessment and the result in this subject is 75.62%

Prior to the year 2006, University of Health Sciences used to grant up to 5 grace marks if a student failed by up to 5 marks in one subject and was passing in all other subjects in a professional examination. The honorable Supreme Court of Pakistan vide civil petition no. 314 of 205 judgment dated 27-01-2006 abolished the system of awarding grace marks. In its judgment the court wrote "...this culture of seeking award of grace marks is against the settled principles of good governance and improving the higher standards of professional education more particularly medical education, because the doctors are required to deal with precious human lives. Medical practitioners are expected to be fully equipped with professional skill, knowledge and expertise in the medical discipline to practice the profession, to deal with the patients and looking after their health and hygiene."

This judgment was discussed in the meeting of syndicate to ensure absolute error-free justice, syndicate decided and passed an order to audit each result before declaration. According to the audit rules that all students who fail by a margin of 3 marks, all their question scripts and MCQ response forms are presented to at least two independent senior subject specialists to “recheck” all the papers to ensure:

1. The rules and regulations of examinations of University of Health Sciences have been strictly adhered to in the process of assessment.

2. To evaluate whether the SEQs have been assessed strictly as per referenced key provided, that no portion or part thereof has been left unmarked and that there is no totaling mistake thereby leaving no doubt that anyone who was marginally failing due to an error at the end of the assessment including strict marking.
The audit of all the subjects of MBBS 2nd Prof. Annual 2011 Examinations was conducted as per rules.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject</th>
<th>Members</th>
<th>Scripts audited</th>
<th>Duration</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pharmacology</td>
<td><strong>Prof. Dr. Muhammad Saeed Anwar</strong>&lt;br&gt;Head of Pharmacology Department, Allama Iqbal Medical College, Lahore.</td>
<td>209</td>
<td>7th to 11th Feb, 2012</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Prof. Dr. Naveed Iqbal Ansari</strong>&lt;br&gt;Head of Pharmacology Department, Gujranwala Medical College, Lahore.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General Pathology</td>
<td><strong>Prof. Dr. Asim Mumtaz</strong>&lt;br&gt;Head of Pathology Department, Shalamar Medical &amp; Dental College, Lahore.</td>
<td>166</td>
<td>9th to 13th Feb, 2012</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Dr. Maleeha Aslam</strong>&lt;br&gt;Professor of Microbiology&lt;br&gt;Allama Iqbal Medical College, Lahore.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Forensic Medicine</td>
<td><strong>Prof. Dr. Amir Bashir</strong>&lt;br&gt;Head of Department, Forensic Medicine&lt;br&gt;Lahore Medical &amp; Dental College, Lahore.</td>
<td>162</td>
<td>8th to 16th Feb, 2012</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Dr. Tajammul Hussain Chaudhry</strong>&lt;br&gt;Assistant Professor, Forensic Medicine&lt;br&gt;Allama Iqbal Medical College, Lahore.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Behavioral Sciences</td>
<td>The Rechecking Committee of UHS:&lt;br&gt;<strong>Prof. Dr. Junaid Sarfraz Khan</strong>&lt;br&gt;Controller of Examinations&lt;br&gt;<strong>Mr. M. Nabeel</strong>&lt;br&gt;Assistant Controller of Examinations&lt;br&gt;Secrecy Wing&lt;br&gt;<strong>Mr. M. Ajmal Sattar</strong>&lt;br&gt;Assistant Controller of Examinations&lt;br&gt;Secrecy Wing&lt;br&gt;<strong>Miss Maryam Habib</strong>&lt;br&gt;Station Incharge</td>
<td>All the MCQ Response Forms were double run in two separate Optical Mark Reader (OMR) Machines and 10% of the total were checked manually. Furthermore 685 MCQ Response Forms were rechecked manually at the time of the audit.</td>
<td>7th to 15th Feb, 2012</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Right from the outset it has been mentioned that observations were only received regarding the Question Paper of General Pathology and no observations were received against the question papers of Pharmacology and Therapeutics, Forensic Medicine and Toxicology and Behavioural Sciences. As per rules and regulations of examinations a committee was appointed by the Convener Board of Studies (BoS) Medicine:
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject Committee</th>
<th>Committee members</th>
<th>Met on (date)</th>
<th>Decision</th>
<th>Implemented</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>General Pathology</td>
<td><strong>Prof. Dr. Ghazala Jaffery</strong>&lt;br&gt;Head of Pathology Department, Services Institute of Medical Sciences, Lahore.</td>
<td><strong>25-01-12</strong></td>
<td>In SEQs Question Paper, Question No. 12 should be considered under the heading of “Difficulty Index” as “Aspergillus” is not written anywhere in the syllabus. (Annexure 'N')</td>
<td>Question no. 12 did not fall under the Difficulty Index criteria and its deletion would therefore have detrimentally affected the result of students. Therefore, Question 12 was not deleted.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Prof. Saeed Anwar</strong>&lt;br&gt;Associate Professor&lt;br&gt;Services Institute of Medical Sciences, Lahore.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The system of assessment at University of Health Sciences is such that all question scripts of SEQs are bar-coded. After application of fictitious roll numbers, all the scripts are separated question-wise and are marked in the University under fictitious cover by senior subject specialists such that one question of all the students is marked by the same assessor. Students and individual colleges cannot be identified. As elucidated above the papers are subsequently audited.

Following the result I believe there was a **sponsored** agitation in different cities against the result that even led to putting on fire the regional office of UHS in Multan. Within two days the Vice Chancellor called a meeting of all the Twenty-Eight Principals of affiliated Public and Private Medical Colleges. All the Principals deliberated at length and unanimously recommended that independent committees of subject specialists should be set up to review the Questions Papers of all the subjects of second professional MBBS 2011, examinations and that the supplementary examination of MBBS 2nd Professional, 2011, will be held 40 days after the decision of University, regarding the matter, has been notified. The committees notified, their members who met on 24th of February 2012 and their decisions following review of question papers are reproduced below for ready reference:
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject</th>
<th>Committee members</th>
<th>Decision</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Pharmacology | Prof. Dr. Muhammad Saeed Anwar  
Head of Pharmacology Department, Allama Iqbal Medical College  
Prof. Dr. Naveed Iqbal Ansari  
Head of Pharmacology Department, Gujranwala Medical College, Lahore.  
Prof. Dr. Riffat Mehmoord Butt  
Professor of Pharmacology, Allama Iqbal Medical College, Lahore. | “The committee reviewed the question papers i.e. SEQ and MCQ in detail and the following observations and comments are being forwarded:  
1. **SEQ Paper:**  
   - The paper was according to the prescribed syllabus and as per Table of Specifications designed.  
   - All the questions were according to the level of undergraduate students of MBBS 2nd Professional.  
   - No question was out of the prescribed course.  
2. **MCQ Paper:**  
   - The paper was according to the prescribed syllabus and as per Table of Specifications designed.  
   - All the questions were according to the level of undergraduate students of MBBS 2nd Professional.  
   - No question was out of the prescribed course.” |
| General Pathology | Prof. Dr. Nosheen Wasim Yousuf  
Head of Pathology Department, Allama Iqbal Medical College, Lahore.  
Prof. Dr. Ghazala Jaffery  
Head of Pathology Department, Services Institute of Medical Sciences, Lahore.  
Prof. Dr. Asim Murtaza  
Head of Pathology Department, Shalamar Medical & Dental College, Lahore. | “Pathology Paper for 2nd Prof. MBBS Annual Examination 2011 was thoroughly scrutinized. Unanimous decision is that the paper is absolutely acceptable and is up to the standard of the 2nd Prof. MBBS students.” |
| Forensic Medicine and Toxicology | Prof. Dr. Amir Bashir  
Head of Department, Forensic Medicine Lahore Medical & Dental College, Lahore.  
Prof. Dr. Shahid Hanif  
Head of Department, Forensic Medicine Akhtar Saeed Medical & Dental College Lahore.  
Dr. Tajammul Hussain Chaudhry  
Assistant Professor, Forensic Medicine, Allama Iqbal Medical College, Lahore.  
Dr. Arif Rasheed Malik  
Associate Professor, Forensic Medicine Gujranwala Medical College, Lahore. | “The committee members gathered in the examinations department at 2:30 p.m. on 24-02-2012. The committee thoroughly reviewed the question papers of forensic medicine and toxicology and is of unanimous opinion that:  
The questions in both the MCQs and SEQ papers are from within the undergraduate syllabus prescribed by UHS.  
The Questions in both MCQ and SEQ Papers in general, are neither complicated nor difficult except Q.No. 32 (MCQ Paper) that has already been deleted as per difficulty index formula set by UHS, Lahore. All the question of MCQ and SEQ are within the comprehension of undergraduate students.” |
The committee members unanimously decided that the papers were checked thoroughly. All the questions were individually screened. The review indicated that there are three ambiguous questions that needed to be corrected. However, as per record of examinations department it was clear that these three questions had already been deleted from assessment. The review committee is of the opinion that the paper is in order and there is no margin of correction or giving advantage to the students. It is within the syllabus prescribed by the University of Health Sciences and at undergraduate levels.

In accordance with the orders of the Supreme Court related to the abolishment of grace marks, international accreditation of assessment and evaluation at University of Health Sciences and in light of the reports by the review committees the result cannot be changed. There is no recommendation to change the result.

The students, however, have an option of seeing their papers by submitting application for “rechecking” on designated University of Health Sciences Forms through their respective Principals and fulfilling all codal formalities.

The date for supplementary examination has been fixed on 20th April 2012 i.e. 40 days after the reports of the committees as per decision in the Principals’ Meeting).

Submitted for your information and record please.

Prof. Dr. Junaid Sarfraz Khan
Controller of Examinations

Prof. Malik Hussain Mubashar
Vice Chancellor,
University of Health Sciences,
Lahore.